

Katie Hobbs
Governor



Jack Confer
Executive Director

Board Meeting Minutes

The regular meeting of the Board of Respiratory Care Examiners convened at 9:00am, Thursday, Dec 19, 2024 in Boardroom C, at 1740 W. Adams Street, Phoenix, Arizona, with Tracy Cagan RCP, Board Chairman, presiding.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Tracy Cagan, RCP, Chairman
Alan Crawford, RCP, Vice-Chairman
Becky Renee Brimhall, Member

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT TELEPHONICALLY:

Kimberly Cota, RCP, Member
Rayana Mariland, Member

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT:

Dr. Leslie Easley, D.O., Member
Lauri Leadley, Member

LEGAL COUNSEL:

Charles Hover, III, Assistant Attorney General
Roberto Pulver, Assistant Attorney General

STAFF PRESENT:

Jack Confer, Executive Director
Donita McGlasson, Interim Deputy Director
Katja Garcia, Licensing Administrator
Rachael Fowkes, Project Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 9:00am, Thursday, Dec 19, 2024 .

Chairman Cagan welcomed members of the audience, explained the procedure for addressing the Board, and stated the mission of the Board.

II. ROLL CALL

The following Board members were present: Chairman Cagan, Vice Chairman Crawford, Member Brimhall, Member Cota, Member Dr. Easley

III. DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST – A.R.S. § 38-503

None

IV. DECLARATION OF RECUSAL(S):

None

V. CALL TO THE PUBLIC:

None

VI. REVIEW, DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

- A. Regular Board Meeting Minutes, August 15, 2024
- B. Regular Board Meeting Minutes, September 26, 2024
- C. Executive Session Meeting Minutes, September 26, 2024 - POSTPONED
- D. Regular Board Meeting Minutes, October 24, 2024
- E. Regular Board Meeting Minutes, November 21, 2024

Member Brimhall ▾ motioned, Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ seconded, to approve the Regular Board Meeting Minutes.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

YOTE	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

VII. REVIEW, DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON FORMAL ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING(S) PURSUANT TO A.R.S. § 32-3553(H), OR, ALTERNATIVELY, CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON PROPOSED CONSENT AGREEMENTS IN LIEU OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS:

Postponed to a future meeting

VIII. REVIEW, DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON INVESTIGATION OF ALLEGATIONS OF UNPROFESSIONAL CONDUCT & POSSIBLE SUMMARY SUSPENSION PURSUANT TO A.R.S. § 32-3553 (E)

A. Erik Holman, Case# 2023-RCE-0065

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ motioned, Member Brimhall ▾ seconded, to move into Executive Session for legal advice at 9:13a.m. The Board returned at 9:25a.m.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

<u>VOTE</u>	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ motioned, Member Cota, RCP ▾ seconded, to summarily suspend RCP Holman’s license.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

<u>VOTE</u>	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ motioned, Member Brimhall ▾ seconded, to amend the complaint notice of hearing to include violation of board order.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

<u>VOTE</u>	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
--------------------	--------------------------	-------------------------------------	---------------------------	-----------------------	-------------------------	--------------------------	---------------------------

YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

IX. REVIEW, DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON APPLICATION FOR LICENSURE PURSUANT TO A.R.S. § 32-3552 (A)

- A. Ramirez, Andrew, Case# 2024-RCE-279 Postponed to a future meeting
- B. Pulido, Michelle, Case# 2024-RCE-278 Postponed to a future meeting

X. INITIAL REVIEW, CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE CONSOLIDATION OF CASES AND ACTION ON INVESTIGATION OF ALLEGATIONS OF UNPROFESSIONAL CONDUCT

A. Staff Recommendation for Non-Disciplinary Order of Probation.

- 1. 2024-RCE-190 Angela Agadjanian
- 2. 2024-RCE-193 Abdullah Hussaini
- 3. 2024-RCE-202 Usman Aluko
- 4. 2024-RCE-205 Balal Hasanzada
- 5. 2024-RCE-207 Jeffrey Benek
- 6. 2024-RCE-216 Michael Callahan

Member Brimhall ▾ motioned, Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ seconded, to dismiss this matter.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

VOTE	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

- 7. POSTPONED
- 8. 2024-RCE-223 Kim Peralta

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ motioned, Member Cota, RCP ▾ seconded, to dismiss this matter.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

VOTE	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
-------------	--------------------------	-------------------------------------	---------------------------	-----------------------	-------------------------	--------------------------	---------------------------

YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

- 9. 2024-RCE-231 Alma Arvizu
- 10. 2024-RCE-238 Susan Bunning
- 11. 2024-RCE-241 Mgcini Ndiweni
- 12. 2024-RCE-242 Lasheena Tucker
- 13. 2024-RCE-246 Cory Phillips
- 14. 2024-RCE-247 Kendra Seyller
- 15. 2024-RCE-258 Larisa Metzler
- 16. 2024-RCE-261 Linda Trujillo
- 17. 2024-RCE-265 Maria Campagne

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP ▾ motioned, Member Brimhall ▾ seconded, to issue a non-disciplinary order for one hour of ethics CE to be completed.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

VOTE	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

[Block Vote for Items 1-5 & 9-16]

Member Brimhall ▾ motioned, Member Cota, RCP ▾ seconded, to issue a non-disciplinary order of probation to complete the missing continuing education hours.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

VOTE	<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

B. Staff Recommendation for Non-Disciplinary Letter of Concern(s).

- | | | |
|-----|--------------|-------------------|
| 1. | 2024-RCE-166 | Gregory Ellis |
| 2. | 2024-RCE-191 | Kevin Boudinot |
| 3. | 2024-RCE-194 | Rafael Merle |
| 4. | 2024-RCE-199 | Thomas McGuire |
| 5. | 2024-RCE-217 | Yvonne Crumley |
| 6. | 2024-RCE-232 | Stephanie Ayers |
| 7. | 2024-RCE-235 | Christine Ramirez |
| 8. | 2024-RCE-255 | Katherine Ritchie |
| 9. | 2024-RCE-259 | Anita Donovan |
| 10. | 2024-RCE-260 | Gisela Huerta |
| 11. | 2024-RCE-263 | Joe Groat |
| 12. | 2024-RCE-233 | Julie Morales |

[Block Vote for Items 1-12]

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP motioned, Member Brimhall seconded, to issue Non-Disciplinary Letters of Concern for failing to complete continuing education within the appropriate renewal time frame.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

VOTE	Cagan Chairman	Crawford Vice Chairman	Brimhall Member	Cota Member	Easley Member	Leadley Member	Mariland Member
YES	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
NO	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

C. Staff Recommendation for Dismissal(s)

- | | | |
|-----|--------------|---------------------|
| 1. | 2024-RCE-195 | Beverly Detzer |
| 2. | 2024-RCE-201 | Tammy Stroud |
| 3. | 2024-RCE-213 | Shaneequa Johnson |
| 4. | 2024-RCE-218 | Julie Demaline |
| 5. | 2024-RCE-220 | Jessica Dye |
| 6. | 2024-RCE-221 | Denisa Forbes-Adair |
| 7. | 2024-RCE-228 | James Martel |
| 8. | 2024-RCE-236 | Christopher Moore |
| 9. | 2024-RCE-239 | Hirut Gemeda |
| 10. | 2024-RCE-244 | Tanner Johl |
| 11. | 2024-RCE-249 | Kimberly Harris |
| 12. | 2024-RCE-266 | Catherine Fletcher |

[Block Vote for Items 1-12]

Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP motioned, Member Cota, RCP seconded, to dismiss these matters.

ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0)

<u>VOTE</u>		<u>Cagan</u> Chairman	<u>Crawford</u> Vice Chairman	<u>Brimhall</u> Member	<u>Cota</u> Member	<u>Easley</u> Member	<u>Leadley</u> Member	<u>Mariland</u> Member
YES		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
NO		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSTAIN		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
RECUSED		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ABSENT		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

XI. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT:

- A. Application, Investigation & Probation Reports (Board Update & Status)
- B. Financial Report
- C. Status, Possible Discussion, Executive Director ISA

XII. FUTURE ITEMS AND MEETING DATES

January 16, 2025, February 20, 2025, March 20, 2025

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Cagan, RCP motioned, Vice Chairman Crawford, RCP seconded, and it was unanimously carried, to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 10:12a.m. Thursday, Dec 19, 2024 .

Jack Confer, Interim Executive Director